

| | | | |
|---------------------------|--|--------------------|-----------------|
| Application Number | 15/0779/LBC | Agenda Item | |
| Date Received | 27th April 2015 | Officer | Mr Tony Collins |
| Target Date | 22nd June 2015 | | |
| Ward | Market | | |
| Site | Old Cavendish Laboratory And Arts School Building New Museums Site Pembroke Street Cambridge Cambridgeshire | | |
| Proposal | Internal and external alterations to the Grade II listed Old Cavendish Laboratory and Arts School Buildings, including the creation of a new ground floor cut-through, removal of the non-original walls and links to the proposed new building for the new student services centre. | | |
| Applicant | University Of Cambridge C/o Agent | | |

| | |
|-----------------------|---|
| <p>SUMMARY</p> | <p>The development accords with the Development Plan for the following reasons:</p> <p>The development would enhance the quality of the site and the conservation area, and provide a strong functional and visual link between this University site and the city centre</p> <p>The harm arising from the creation of a cut-through on the ground floor of the Old Cavendish Building is outweighed by the overall benefits of the scheme</p> <p>No harm would be caused to the special interest of the listed buildings by any of the other changes proposed</p> |
| <p>RECOMMENDATION</p> | <p>APPROVAL</p> |

1.0 SITE DESCRIPTION/AREA CONTEXT

- 1.1 The New Museums Site (NMS) is one of the most prominent faculty sites of the University of Cambridge, lying in the heart of the city. It fills almost the whole of the irregular quadrilateral bounded to the north by Bene't Street and Wheeler Street, to the east by Corn Exchange Street, to the south by Downing Street and Pembroke Street, and to the west by Free School Lane. It has been in the ownership of the University since the eighteenth century, and was originally its Botanic Gardens. From the mid-nineteenth century, the site was developed with buildings for the study of the natural sciences.
- 1.2 The Corn Exchange, and retail premises, including several bars and restaurants fill the small part of this block which is not within the NMS. To the north are the Guildhall, and further retail premises on the north side of Bene't Street. To the east is the Grand Arcade. To the south, across Downing Street and Pembroke Street are the University's Downing site, and Pembroke College. To the west, across Free School Lane, is Corpus Christi College.
- 1.3 This application relates to the North Range of this site, the buildings which run across the northern edge of the NMS, from Free School Lane to the point where the site meets the tiny cul-de-sac of Parson's Court, on the west side of the Corn Exchange. There are three linked buildings in this range, the Old Cavendish Laboratory and its Rayleigh Wing, stretching alongside, and east from, Free School Lane, the Arts School, fronting on to Bene't Yard, a small turning off Bene't Street, and the Examination Halls, in the north-east corner, backing on to Parson's Court. The application also relates to two other buildings which lie immediately to the south of this group, the Mond Annexe, and the Austin Building.
- 1.4 The whole of this site lies within City of Cambridge Conservation Area No.1 (Central). The Old Cavendish Building, the Rayleigh Wing, the Arts School and the Mond Building to the south of the site are all listed Grade II. The Examination Halls, the Austin Building, and the Mond Annexe are unlisted, but the Mond Annexe is a Building of Local Interest. To the north of the site, the Corn Exchange, all of the retail premises fronting the south side of Wheeler Street and Bene't Street, and No.4 Parsons Court are also listed Grade II.

1.5 The Conservation Officer has outlined the heritage value of the buildings in their consultation response which I accept

2.0 THE PROPOSAL

2.1 The associated development proposal is for extensive works to the northern part of the New Museums site, involving the demolition of some buildings, the alteration of others and the construction of a new Student Services Centre (SSC) on the site of the present Exam Halls.

2.2 The works for which listed building consent is sought are as follows.

Arts School

- Opening up of recessed notch in east elevation to allow link with new SSC
- Removal of fire escapes
- New windows in second floor of south elevation
- Attachment of glazed link to SSC
- New fire doors at east end
- New basement cycle parking
- New basement showers
- Removal of basement toilets
- Refurbishment of ground floor lecture theatre
- Improvement of disabled access to lecture theatre by creation of moveable seating
- Removal of lift
- Replacement of existing basement stairs
- Removal of ground floor partitions, insertion of new partitions, creation of new openings
- Removal of first floor partitions and creation of new opening
- Conversion of second floor library space for Careers Service use
- Removal of some later bookcases
- Reinstatement of landing columns

Old Cavendish Building

- Cut-through created from Bene't Yard to the interior of the site
- Door in south elevation converted to window

- Removal of ground floor internal partitions
- Insertion of small windows in the side wall of the cut-through
- New openings, new ramp
- Floor created in former double-height space at east end

2.3 The proposal forms the second phase of a Masterplan for the new Museums site, which seeks to ensure a coherent and sensitive redevelopment of the site.

3.0 SITE HISTORY

3.1 There is extensive planning history on the New Museums site, both within the present application site, and beyond it, but the only applications of relevance to this application are those listed below.

| Reference | Description | Outcome |
|------------------|---|--------------------------|
| 13/1093/FUL | Change of use of Arup Building (now David Attenborough Building) from D1 to B1/D1, with alterations and refurbishment | Approved with conditions |
| 15/0772/FUL | Demolition of Rolls Royce Building | Approved with conditions |
| 15/0777/FUL | New Student Services Centre, alterations to Arts School and Old Cavendish Building. Demolition of Mond Annexe and northsection of Austin Building | Under consideration |

4.0 PUBLICITY

| | | |
|-----|------------------------|-----|
| 4.1 | Advertisement: | Yes |
| | Adjoining Owners: | Yes |
| | Site Notice Displayed: | Yes |

5.0 POLICY

5.1 See Appendix 1 for full details of Central Government Guidance, Cambridge Local Plan 2006 policies, Supplementary Planning Documents and Material Considerations.

5.2 Relevant Development Plan policies

| PLAN | POLICY NUMBER |
|---------------------------|--------------------------------|
| Cambridge Local Plan 2006 | 3/1 3/4 3/12 4/10 4/11 4/12 |

5.3 Relevant Central Government Guidance, Supplementary Planning Documents and Material Considerations

| | |
|---------------------------------|---|
| Central Government Guidance | National Planning Policy Framework March 2012 National Planning Policy Framework – Planning Practice Guidance March 2014 Circular 11/95 |
| Supplementary Planning Guidance | Sustainable Design and Construction (May 2007) |
| | <u>Area Guidelines</u> Cambridge Historic Core Conservation Area Appraisal (2006) |

5.4 Status of Proposed Submission – Cambridge Local Plan

Planning applications should be determined in accordance with policies in the adopted Development Plan and advice set out in the NPPF. However, after consideration of adopted plans and the NPPF, policies in emerging plans can also be given some weight when determining applications. For Cambridge,

therefore, the emerging revised Local Plan as published for consultation on 19 July 2013 can be taken into account, especially those policies where there are no or limited objections to it. However it is likely, in the vast majority of instances, that the adopted development plan and the NPPF will have considerably more weight than emerging policies in the revised Local Plan.

For the application considered in this report, no policies in the emerging Local Plan are of relevance:

6.0 CONSULTATIONS

Cambridgeshire County Council (Highways Development Management)

- 6.1 No objection. Condition sought to ensure a traffic management plan for the construction period.

Urban Design and Conservation Team

- 6.2 In general, it is acknowledged that much of what is proposed comprises removal of non-original partitions which are not of significance. In some rooms, the re-establishment of the room's proportions resultant on removal of non-original partitions will be a considerable benefit to the character of the listed buildings.

Cavendish Labs

- 6.3 Proposed creation of a cut through between Benet's Yard and a new "third court" is a major intervention which in isolation, is harmful. The applicant's justification for it is for permeability within the site and to open access the area of open space enclosed by the East Wing.
- 6.4 The opening would initially be large one to enable movement for demolition/construction materials to/from the site. The cut-through would subsequently be "reduced" to two arches on either side as shown on submitted drawings.
- 6.5 Removal of first floor structure over the opening would not be acceptable. It is important that central piers are reinstated when the materials moving stages of this project have been carried out and that window arch brickwork is retained. The treatment

of the walls and ceiling exposed by the through link is also important. Provided the cut-through is detailed satisfactorily its impact on the building may be balanced against the benefits of the proposed re-establishment of ground floor layouts by removal of later partitions. At present though, the detailing is not considered satisfactory and would need to be the subject of a condition.

Arts School

- 6.6 Comment on the proposed glazed link between the Arts School and the new part of the SSC is made on the planning application response. The “entry” points at which this links into the Arts School take advantage of the existing layout and are considered satisfactory.
- 6.7 Opening-up of North elevation roundel windows is acceptable in principle. New openings for SSC reception off the Arts School main corridor are acceptable subject to treatment of openings and existing wall panelling.
- 6.8 The principle of new openings in the South upper blank elevation to provide windows into the current library is acceptable in principle and provided they can be integrated with retention of a substantial number of the book cases on the wall through altering the configuration/size of the proposed windows.

Conclusion

- 6.9 Subject to the conditions below to ensure appropriate detailing and the re-instatement of the piers in the proposed Cavendish cut-through, the proposals are considered consistent with Cambridge Local Plan Policy 4/10 (Listed Buildings).

Design and Conservation Panel (Meetings of 10th December 2014, 11th February 2015 and 10th June 2015)

- 6.10 The conclusions of the Panel meetings did not touch in any detail on the aspects of the proposal which require listed building consent, but following the meeting on 10th June 2015, the minutes stated that the Panel felt this was a satisfactory conclusion to the first of many chapters in the transformation of the New Museums Site, and that the architects have brought a degree of sophistication and elegance to upgrading the existing

Arts School building and inserting a new development. Panel concluded that providing the landscaping is of a sufficiently high standard, the changes proposed will improve the environment and gave a verdict of: **GREEN (6) AMBER (1)**

- 6.11 The full relevant sections of the minutes of the panel meetings are attached to the report on 15/0777/FUL as Appendices A(December 2014), B(February 2015), and C(Jun 2015).

Historic England

- 6.12 Advise that the overall impact of the proposal on the conservation area would be neutral.
- 6.13 Satisfied that harm to the significance of the Grade II Cavendish Laboratory caused by creation of ground-level cut-through is outweighed by the benefit of increased permeability of the site. Satisfied that the significance of the Arts School would not be harmed by alterations proposed, and that overall scheme is in accordance with NPPG.
- 6.14 Provided the scheme is amended to include reinstatement of window arch brickwork on the internal side of the cut-through (facing the Mond Building), no objections.

Victorian Society

- 6.15 No objection to improving access to the site by creating an opening through the New Cavendish Building, or to the alterations proposed to the Arts School building.

20th Century Society

- 6.16 Comments refer only to the Mond Annexe, which is not the subject of this application
- 6.17 The above responses are a summary of the comments that have been received. Full details of the consultation responses can be inspected on the application file.

7.0 REPRESENTATIONS

- 7.1 Representations have been received from Cambridge Past Present and Future. The representations relate only to matters

which do not require listed building consent. I have addressed them in my report on the related planning application.

- 7.2 The above representations are a summary of the comments that have been received. Full details of the representations can be inspected on the application file.

8.0 ASSESSMENT

- 8.1 From the consultation responses and representations received and from my inspection of the site and the surroundings, I consider that the main issues are:

1. Impact on the listed buildings
2. Impact on the conservation area
3. Highway safety

Impact on the listed buildings

- 8.2 It is acknowledged that the creation of a cut-through in the ground floor of the Old Cavendish Building would result in loss of historic fabric, and taken in isolation, would cause harm to the listed building. However, the Council's own conservation team, Historic England, and the Victorian Society are all agreed that the benefits of creating this new link into the site and enhancing the spaces on either side (Bene't Yard and the new Courtyard 3) are considerable, and clearly outweigh the harm. It is essential that the fabric of the rest of the building is protected during the works, and that the reinstatement of the piers, the inner courtyard elevation and the 'inside' surfaces of the cut-through are carried out in an appropriate manner. I recommend conditions to ensure this.
- 8.3 I do not consider that any of the other alterations to the Cavendish or the Arts School: the insertion of new windows, the linking to the SSC by a glazed section, or the alteration of internal partitions, would have any harmful impact on the listed buildings. In fact, I am of the view that many of these changes would enhance the character of the listed buildings, and enable their special qualities to be more readily and more fully appreciated. Subject to appropriate conditions on detail, it is my view that all of the proposals are in accordance with policy 4/10 of the Cambridge Local Plan 2006.

Impact on the conservation area

- 8.4 As I have indicated, I am of the view that the changes proposed would enhance the character of the conservation area. The link through the ground floor of the Old Cavendish Laboratory and the associated improvements to Bene't yard would increase permeability, open up additional views, create a greater sense of space, allow the listed buildings to be more fully appreciated, and establish a clear visual and functional route from the heart of the city centre into this part of the University. I am satisfied that notwithstanding the loss of historic fabric and the significant alteration to the form of the Old Cavendish Building, the proposal would be in accordance with policy 4/11 of the Cambridge Local Plan 2006.

Highway Safety

- 8.5 The highway authority has raised issues about the impact of the construction process. That impact will be significant, but I concur with the highway authority that it can be addressed by condition.

9.0 CONCLUSION

- 9.1 The proposals are acceptable.

10.0 RECOMMENDATION

APPROVE subject to the following conditions:

1. The development hereby permitted shall be begun before the expiration of three years from the date of this consent.

Reason: To comply with the requirements of Section 18 of the Planning (Listed Building & Conservation Areas) Act 1990 (as amended by section 51(4) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004).

2. Prior to the demolition of the adjoining Examination Schools building a system for monitoring the Arts School building for movement during demolition, excavation and construction shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority. The submission shall include details of acceptable parameters, frequency and accuracy of measurements, and location of monitoring points and shall include a statement of who is responsible for monitoring and reviewing the results of the data, for informing the local planning authority and Building Control surveyors if results exceed the acceptable parameters and for taking preventative action to avoid damage to the listed building in the event of adverse movement.

Reason: To avoid harm to the special interest of the listed building and to be consistent with Cambridge Local Plan 2006 Policy 4/10 (Listed Buildings).

3. No alterations to the listed buildings shall take place until a full photographic record and survey has been made depicting the exterior and interiors of the buildings and a copy deposited with the Cambridgeshire County Archive, Shire Hall, Castle Hill, Cambridge. The nature of the photographs and drawings to be agreed in advance with the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: To foster understanding of the buildings importance in the national and Cambridge context, and to ensure proper recording of any aspects of the buildings special interest which are to be lost or altered in accordance with Cambridge Local Plan 2006 Policy 4/10 (Listed Buildings).

4. Existing ground floor ceiling joists, corbels and beams shall be retained in-situ within the Old Cavendish Building cut-through and drawn details of structural interventions to enable the cut-through shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority prior to the forming of the cut-through. The works shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.

Reason: in the interests of the retention of historic fabric and the character of the listed building and to be consistent with Cambridge Local Plan 2006 Policy 4/10 (Listed Buildings).

5. Notwithstanding submitted drawing 1406_P_415 (Bay Study Passageway South) dated 15.04.15 a revised scheme detailing the appearance of the south elevation of the Old Cavendish Building cut-through including the pier width and profile shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority prior to the forming of the cut-through. The works shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.

Reason: in the interests of the appearance of the elevation and character of the listed building and to be consistent with Cambridge Local Plan 2006 Policy 4/10 (Listed Buildings).

6. Piers as approved shall be reinstated into the Cavendish cut-through prior to the first re-occupation of the Cavendish or occupation of the Student Services Centre building.

Reason: The initial width of the cut-through is only approved as a temporary measure to allow north range site works and would otherwise be harmful to the character of the building and contrary to Cambridge Local Plan 2006 Policy 4/10 (Listed Buildings).

7. Insertion of new windows or the alteration of historic joinery (especially bookcases) in the Arts School Library, shall not be carried out until drawings at a scale of 1:10 of all such works have been submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority. The works shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.

Reason: in the interests of the retention of historic fabric and the character of the listed building and to be consistent with Cambridge Local Plan 2006 Policy 4/10 (Listed Buildings).

INFORMATIVE: The applicant is urged to consider the inclusion of a hearing loop in the refurbished lecture theatre, and to take all possible steps to meet the needs of disabled lecturers in this room as well as disable listeners