WEST/CENTRAL AREA COMMITTEE Date: 20th August 2009

| Application Number | 09/0390/LBC | Agenda Item | | |
|-----------------------------|--|----------------|------------------|--|
| Date Received | 14th May 2009 | Officer | Mr John Evans | |
| Target Date Ward Site | 9th July 2009 Castle 18 - 18A St Peters Street Cambridge | | | |
| Proposal Applicant | Cambridgeshire CB3 0BD Refurbishment of existing college accommodation (8 bedrooms as existing) and workshop buildings to form 4 college bedrooms and 1-bedroom apartment with artists' studios in the former Langdon Building. Erection of new College accommodation to rear of site providing 3 bedrooms. John Harris St Johns College Cambridge CB2 1TP | | | |

1.0 SITE DESCRIPTION/AREA CONTEXT

- 1.1 The application site is a rectangular shaped plot situated on the southern side of St Peters Street. The property is formed of 18 and 18A, which at present are 2 separate dwelling houses used as accommodation for 8 students. The plan form of the building is broadly U shaped, with 2 front projections which comprise of a single storey garage extension and the Langdon Building, a former carpenters and joiner's workshop.
- 1.2 Externally, the site is bounded by a 3m high wall which fronts Honey Hill to the east, and an approximately 2.5m wall to the western boundary with Honey Hill Mews. To the south, the curtilage of the property is defined with a 2m high wooden fence, beyond which are the Honey Hill Mews flats.
- 1.3 The building is Grade 2 Listed and the entire site is within the City of Cambridge Central Conservation Area.

2.0 THE PROPOSAL

2.1 This application for Listed Building consent comprises of 2 elements. The largely internal works to the main Listed Building

and Langdon workshop, and the erection of a linked dwelling, providing student accommodation and a studio flat within the rear garden area. A small single storey extension will be demolished to the rear of the building.

- 2.2 The proposed use of the building and extensions has changed from the previous scheme approved in 2002, (C/02/1294). The College has reviewed its needs and the scheme no longer seeks to provide further graduate accommodation, (17 student rooms previously approved). As such, this current proposal will provide predominantly family type accommodation. The new linked 3 bedroom dwelling and studio flat are likely to be suitable for postgraduate students with families and the existing 18/18A St Peters Street is to be converted into a single 4 bedroom dwelling, to be occupied by the College Chaplain. The front 2 storey workshop projection will be converted to 6 small artists' studio/workshop areas, within what is known as the Langdon Building.
- 2.3 To rear of site, the new linked 3 bedroom dwelling house is provided over 3 levels. The main plan form of the dwelling is rectangular, with an overall projection of approximately 17m to the south west from the rear wall of the main Listed Building. The link section is set down from the new dwelling by 2m and there is access through to the refuse store and garden area, underneath, on the ground floor.
- 2.4 The application is accompanied by the following supporting information:
 - 1. Design and Access Statement
 - 2. Heritage Statement
 - 3. Planning Statement
 - 4. Structural Engineers Report

3.0 SITE HISTORY

| Reference | Description | Outcome |
|-----------|----------------------------------|-----------|
| C/01/1374 | Demolition of the langdon | Approved |
| | workshop building and other | |
| | buildings in association with | |
| | Planning Reference | |
| | C/01/1373/FP. | |
| C/01/1373 | Conversion of existing house and | Withdrawn |

| | extension to form student hostel and 2no flats. | |
|-----------|---|----------|
| C/02/1291 | Internal and external alterations and demolition of extensions to | Approved |
| | Grade II Listed Building. | |
| C/02/1294 | Conversion of existing house and extension to form student hostel and 2No. fellows flats. | Approved |

4.0 PUBLICITY

| 4.1 | Advertisement: | Yes |
|-----|------------------------|-----|
| | Adjoining Owners: | Yes |
| | Site Notice Displayed: | Yes |

5.0 POLICY

- 5.1 Central Government Advice
- 5.2 **PPG15 Planning and the Historic Environment (1994):** This guidance provides advice on the identification and protection of historic buildings, conservation areas and other elements of the historic environment.
- 5.3 **Circular 11/95 The Use of Conditions in Planning Permissions:** Advises that conditions should be necessary, relevant to planning, relevant to the development permitted, enforceable, precise and reasonable in all other respects.

5.4 East of England Plan 2008

ENV6 The historic environment

5.5 Cambridge Local Plan 2006

4/10 Listed Buildings 4/11 Conservation Areas

5.6 Material Considerations

Cambridge Historic Core – Conservation Area Appraisal (2005): Provides an appraisal of the Historic Core of Cambridge.

6.0 CONSULTATIONS

Cambridgeshire County Council (Highways)

6.1 No Objections. The existing and future residents do not qualify for Residents Parking permits on the parking schemes within the surrounding streets.

Head of Environmental Services

- 6.2 No objections in principle, subject to the imposition of conditions relating to construction hours and waste.
- 6.3 The above responses are a summary of the comments that have been received. Full details of the consultation responses can be inspected on the application file.

7.0 REPRESENTATIONS

7.1 Councillor Hipkin has commented on this application. The representation is set out below:

Dear John

I have concerns about the impact of this proposal upon neighbouring properties and would therefore request that it should be brought before the West Central Area Committee for determination.

John Hipkin

7.2 The owners/occupiers of the following addresses have made representations: 10 Honey Hill Mews and 13 Honey Hill Gardens and Honey Hill Mews (1990) Limited (the company that owns and manages the land and buildings of Honey Hill Mews).

- 7.3 The representations can be summarised as follows:
 - The proposed redevelopment would be an over intense development in a domestic residential area with the rear 3 storey new build out of keeping with adjacent buildings.
 - The proposal extends back behind the current rear building line of the adjacent properties.
 - The new build is too high as it rises above the gutter level of the Honey Hill Mews flats.
 - The proposed works would block views of St Peters Church and Castle Mound.
 - The proposed building should be sufficiently clear of the joint boundary with Honey Hill Mews to allow for maintenance.
 - The proposed flat roofing is unacceptable in the neighbourhood.
 - Inadequate parking provision.
 - Level of nuisance caused by noise.
 - No provision for cars and motorcycles or deliveries.
- 7.4 The above representations are a summary of the comments that have been received. Full details of the representations can be inspected on the application file.

8.0 ASSESSMENT

- 8.1 From the consultation responses and representations received and from my inspection of the site and the surroundings, I consider that the main issue is the impact upon the character, appearance and historic interest of the Listed Building and its setting.
- 8.2 Planning permission has already been granted for a similar scheme in 2002, although this was not implemented. This report considers the appropriateness of this current scheme in light of this previous approval.

- 8.3 The key difference between the previous consent and the current application relates to the overall height of the building and its junction with the Listed Building; which in turn forms the main thrust of objection from neighbouring properties. The previous building was approximately 2m lower in height, roughly in line with eaves level of the main building. Whereas the height of the new dwelling is approximately 2m above the eaves of the existing building. Whilst concerns are noted regarding its overall height, in particular the relationship of the new building with the adjacent flats, its proportions are considered to be on balance acceptable, for 3 main reasons.
- 8.4 Firstly, the overall form and proportions of this current scheme is in my view an improvement on the previous 2002 application. Local Plan policy 3/12 states that new buildings should have a positive impact on their setting in terms of location on the site, height, scale, form, materials, detailing and wider townscape views. Extensions to existing buildings should also reflect or successfully contrast their form and architectural detailing, should not dominate neighbouring buildings and, within a Conservation Area, should seek to preserve or enhance its character and appearance. The proposed linked dwelling provides an improved separation between the existing semi detached Listed Building by leaving the majority of the rear elevation of the Listed Building as original, with the introduction of the recessed link section. The new dwelling has been designed with a stronger definition and as a separate form, and the removal of the 2 storey flat roof infill section that was previously approved is an improvement to the junction with the existing Listed Building and the new additions.
- 8.5 Secondly, the new building should be considered in terms of its overall composition with the Listed Building. The Listed Building is characterised by the extensions of the Langdon workshop and garage, therefore a larger extension to the rear, which is clearly set apart from the main the Listed Building, would not in my view be unduly out of character. The principle of a relatively large extension to the rear of the property is well established with the approval of the previous scheme in 2002.
- 8.6 Thirdly, whilst the new building rises above the eaves level of the Listed Building at its highest point, the roof slopes back at a shallow angle which reduces its overall prominence, particularly when viewed from within Honey Hill Mews, and the high wall to

the boundary with Honey Hill will mean that only partial views of the building will be possible. In my view, despite the general character of the area being typified by pitched roof forms, the relatively secluded nature of the site will mean that the new building will not unduly visually compete with either the Listed Building, adjacent flats or other buildings within the wider Conservation Area.

- 8.7 Internally, the proposal to convert the 2 properties into 1 dwelling suitable for the College Chaplain, is considered acceptable by the Council's Conservation Team. This is subject to as much of the historic layout of the 2 semi detached properties remaining as possible. There is some concern about the demolition of the partitions to the northern end of the property and the retention of the 'winder staircase'. However, amended plans have been received which clarify the retention of the door and partition, to the benefit of the historic interest of the building.
- 8.8 The first floor alterations are much less radical in the main houses. The conversion of front eastern rooms to bathrooms is acceptable subject to dealing with air extracts and other visually intrusive elements. The blocking of the link through to the historic extension is acceptable subject to detail. The retention of the good sash window frames, skirtings, picture rails, fireplaces, will be essential and can be ensured through the imposition of suitable planning conditions attached to the concurrent Listed Building consent.
- 8.9 To the front of the building, the alterations to the Langdon building are considered to be in keeping with its character and appearance. The Langdon Building is in a very frail structural condition. This scheme will put it back into use, albeit with relatively major structural upgrades, which is unlikely to be avoidable.
- 8.10 The small single storey extension to be demolished is a later unsympathetic addition, and its removal will be to the benefit of the character and appearance of the building.
- 8.11 In my opinion the proposal will not detract from the character and appearance of the Listed Building and Conservation Area and is compliant with Cambridge Local Plan (2006) policies 4/10 and 4/11.

9.0 CONCLUSION

The proposed refurbishment and linked dwelling will not detract from the character, appearance or historic interest of the Grade 2 Listed Building. Approval is recommended.

10.0 RECOMMENDATION

APPROVE and subject to the following conditions:

1. The development hereby permitted shall be begun before the expiration of three years from the date of this permission.

Reason: In accordance with the requirements of section 51 of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004.

2. Prior to the commencement of the development a full Method Statement for the structural and other repairs, extensions and reinstatement of The Langdon Building is to be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved condition.

Reason: In the interests of the character and appearance of the Listed Building, Cambridge Local Plan 2006 policy 4/10.

3. No fireplace, fireplace surround, skirting, dado or picture rail, plate rail or other decorative fixture, doorbell mechanism, ceiling centrepiece, cornice [moulded or run], niche, corbel, bracket, column, arch, pilaster, pedestal, panel moulding or other decorative plaster fixture is to be removed without the express written consent of the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: In the interests of the character and appearance of the Listed Building, Cambridge Local Plan 2006 policy 4/10.

- 4. The drop-pendent brackets mounted on the party wall at the foot of each staircase are to be carefully removed and stored in a safe and secure manner in a place to be agreed with the Local Planning Authority. The plans to remove from storage and to reinstate these items elsewhere within the Listed Building are to be notified to and agreed in advance in writing by the Local Planning Authority.
- 5. No boiler flues, soil pipes, waste pipes or air extract trunking shall be installed until the means of providing egress for all such items from the new or altered bathrooms, kitchens and plant rooms has been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Flues, pipes and trunking shall be installed thereafter only in accordance with the approved details.

Reason: In the interests of the character and appearance of the Listed Building, Cambridge Local Plan 2006 policy 4/10.

6. No brickwork is to be erected until the choice of brick, bond, mortar mix design and pointing technique have been submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority by means of sample panels prepared on site. The approved panels are to be retained on site for the duration of the works for comparative purposes, and development must take place only in accordance with the approved details. All plasterwork and render repairs are to match the historic existing work exactly in every respect and to meet the requirements of English Heritage Technical Handbook, Volume 3. The use of traditional, limebased materials is mandatory.

Reason: In the interests of the character and appearance of the Listed Building, Cambridge Local Plan 2006 policy 4/10.

7. Where the opening is to be created between rooms on the ground floor, full details of the dimensions of the opening and the resultant stub walls and downstand, the linings and architraves to finish the opening and the reinstatement of the flooring between rooms shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.

Reason: In the interests of the character and appearance of the Listed Building, Cambridge Local Plan 2006 policy 4/10.

8. No new, replacement or altered joinery is to be installed, nor existing historic joinery removed, until drawings at a scale of 1:10 of all such joinery (doors and surrounds, windows and frames, sills, skirtings, dado rails, staircases and balustrades) have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Joinery shall thereafter be installed only in accordance with the approved details.

Reason: In the interests of the character and appearance of the Listed Building, Cambridge Local Plan 2006 policy 4/10.

9. Full details of the design and installation of the renewable energy source(s) including plant, mounting frames/brackets and screening systems shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.

Reason: In the interests of the character and appearance of the Listed Building, Cambridge Local Plan 2006 policy 4/10.

10. The location, design and materials of external meter boxes (gas, electricity, water) shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. It is unlikely that white plastic boxes will be agreed on Listed Buildings or in prominent locations in the Conservation Area. The development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.

Reason: In the interests of the character and appearance of the Listed Building, Cambridge Local Plan 2006 policy 4/10.

11. Full details of all works to historic fire places, including fire surrounds, hearth stones, fire backs and decorative tiling shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.

Reason: In the interests of the character and appearance of the Listed Building, Cambridge Local Plan 2006 policy 4/10.

12. All new / repaired / replacement external metal pipework such as downpipes, gutters and soil vent pipes is to match the existing historic type [ie: cast iron, lead] unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Anomalous or unauthorised plastic pipework should not be copied or repeated.

Reason: In the interests of the character and appearance of the Listed Building, Cambridge Local Plan 2006 policy 4/10.

13. Full details of making good exposed areas revealed by demolitions shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.

Reason: In the interests of the character and appearance of the Listed Building, Cambridge Local Plan 2006 policy 4/10.

Reasons for Approval

1. This development has been approved, conditionally, because subject to those requirements it is considered to generally conform to the Development Plan, particularly the following policies:

East of England plan 2008: ENV6

Cambridge Local Plan (2006): 4/10 and 4/11

2. The decision has been made having had regard to all other material planning considerations, none of which was considered to have been of such significance as to justify doing other than grant planning permission.

These reasons for approval can be a summary of the reasons for grant of planning permission only. For further detail on the decision please see the officer report by visiting the Council Planning Department.

LOCAL GOVERNMENT (ACCESS TO INFORMATION) ACT 1985

Under Section 100D of the Local Government Act 1972, the following are "background papers" for each report on a planning application:

- 1. The planning application and plans;
- 2. Any explanatory or accompanying letter or document from the applicant;
- 3. Comments of Council departments on the application;
- 4. Comments or representations by third parties on the application as referred to in the report plus any additional comments received before the meeting at which the application is considered; unless (in each case) the document discloses "exempt or confidential information"
- 5. Any Structure Plan, Local Plan or Council Policy Document referred to in individual reports.

These papers may be inspected by contacting John Summers (Ext.7103) in the Planning Department.

